

Designing and Conducting **Mixed Methods Research**

*This book is for my talented, supportive children—
J. David Creswell and Johanna Creswell.*

—John

*This book is dedicated to Mark for all of his support,
encouragement, friendship, and love. I thank him to the moon and back.*

—Vicki

John W. Creswell
Vicki L. Plano Clark
University of Nebraska-Lincoln

Copyright © 2007 by Sage Publications, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information:



Sage Publications, Inc.
2455 Teller Road
Thousand Oaks, California 91320
E-mail: order@sagepub.com

Sage Publications Ltd.
1 Oliver's Yard
55 City Road
London EC1Y 1SP
United Kingdom

Sage Publications India Pvt. Ltd.
B-42, Panchsheel Enclave
Post Box 4109
New Delhi 110 017 India

Printed in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Creswell, John W.
Designing and conducting mixed methods research / John W. Creswell, Vicki L. Plano Clark.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-4129-2791-9 (cloth)

ISBN 1-4129-2792-7 (pbk.)

1. Social sciences—Research—Methodology. 2. Research—Evaluation.

I. Plano Clark, Vicki L. II. Title.

H62.C6962 2007

001.4'2—dc22

2006008436

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

06 07 08 09 10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Acquisitions Editor: Lisa Cuevas Shaw
Editorial Assistant: Karen Greene
Production Editor: Denise Santoyo
Copy Editor: Catherine Chilton
Typesetter: C&M Digital (P) Ltd.
Indexer: Jeanne Busemeyer

Univerzita knihovna
Západočeské univerzity v Plzni

KN070002151

CONTENTS

List of Tables	xi
List of Figures	xiii
Preface	xv
Purpose of This Book	xv
Audience for the Book	xvi
Book Features	xvi
Acknowledgments	xvii
 Chapter 1. Understanding Mixed Methods Research	 1
Purpose and Organization	2
Clarifying Terms	4
What Is Mixed Methods Research?	5
The Name	5
Quantitative and Qualitative Data	6
Mixing the Data	7
Single or Multiple Studies	8
The Central Premise of the Definition	8
Studies That Fit Our Definition	10
Studies in the Gray Areas	11
The Importance of Mixed Methods Research	13
A Brief History	13
Formative Period	13
Paradigm Debate Period	15
Procedural Developments	15
Recent Indicators of Interest	16
SUMMARY	18
ACTIVITIES	19
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	19
 Chapter 2. Examining Preliminary Considerations	 20
Consider Worldview Stances	21
Different Worldviews or Paradigms	21

Worldviews and Mixed Methods Research	26	The Embedded Design	67
<i>Stance 1: There is one "best" paradigm or worldview that fits mixed methods research</i>	26	<i>Embedded Design Procedures</i>	67
<i>Stance 2: Researchers can use multiple paradigms or worldviews in their mixed methods study</i>	27	<i>Variants of the Embedded Design</i>	69
<i>Stance 3: Worldviews relate to the type of mixed methods design and may vary depending on the type of design</i>	27	<i>Strengths of the Embedded Design</i>	70
The Basics of Quantitative and Qualitative Research	28	<i>Challenges in Using the Embedded Design</i>	70
Research Problems Addressed by Mixed Methods	31	The Explanatory Design	71
A Need Exists for Both Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches	32	<i>Explanatory Design Procedures</i>	72
A Need Exists to Enhance the Study With a Second Source of Data	33	<i>Variants of the Explanatory Design</i>	72
A Need Exists to Explain the Quantitative Results	34	<i>Strengths of the Explanatory Design</i>	74
A Need Exists to First Explore Qualitatively	34	<i>Challenges in Using the Explanatory Design</i>	74
SUMMARY	35	The Exploratory Design	75
ACTIVITIES	35	<i>Exploratory Design Procedures</i>	77
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	36	<i>Variants of the Exploratory Design</i>	77
Chapter 3. Locating and Reviewing Mixed Methods Studies	38	<i>Strengths of the Exploratory Design</i>	78
Searching for and Reviewing Mixed Methods Studies	39	<i>Challenges in Using the Exploratory Design</i>	78
Use Search Terms	39	Selecting a Type of Mixed Methods Design	79
Are the Studies Mixed Methods Research?	39	The Timing Decision	81
A Mixed Methods Notation System and Visual Diagrams	40	The Weighting Decision	81
Four Examples of Mixed Methods Studies	41	The Mixing Decision	83
Study A: Collecting Both Quantitative and Qualitative Data at the Same Time to Understand a Problem (Jenkins, 2001)	44	<i>Merging Data Sets</i>	83
Study B: Using Qualitative Data in an Experiment (Rogers, Day, Randall, & Bentall, 2003)	45	<i>Embedding Data at the Design Level</i>	83
Study C: Explaining Quantitative Results With Qualitative Data (Aldridge, Fraser, & Huang, 1999)	48	<i>Connecting From Data Analysis to Data Collection</i>	83
Study D: Exploring Qualitatively to Develop a Quantitative Instrument (Myers & Oetzel, 2003)	50	Implementing the Design Decisions	84
Similarities and Differences Among the Sample Studies	54	Writing a Paragraph to Identify a Study's Design	86
SUMMARY	56	SUMMARY	86
ACTIVITIES	57	ACTIVITIES	87
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	57	ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	88
Chapter 4. Choosing a Mixed Methods Design	58	Chapter 5. Introducing a Mixed Methods Study	89
Classifications of Mixed Methods Designs	59	Writing a Mixed Methods Title	90
The Four Major Types of Mixed Methods Designs	59	Qualitative and Quantitative Titles	90
The Triangulation Design	62	Mixed Methods Titles	91
<i>Triangulation Design Procedures</i>	62	Stating the Problem in the Introduction	94
<i>Variants of the Triangulation Design</i>	64	Structure of a "Statement of the Problem" Section	94
<i>Strengths of the Triangulation Design</i>	66	Integrate Mixed Methods Into the Statement of the Problem	95
<i>Challenges in Using the Triangulation Design</i>	66	The Purpose Statement	97
	66	Qualitative and Quantitative Purpose Statements	97
		Mixed Methods Purpose Statements	98
		Research Questions and Hypotheses	103
		Qualitative Questions and Quantitative Questions and Hypotheses	103
		Mixed Methods Research Questions	105
		SUMMARY	107
		ACTIVITIES	108

Chapter 6. Collecting Data in Mixed Methods Research	110
Procedures in Qualitative and Quantitative Data Collection	111
Sampling Procedures	112
Permissions Needed	113
Information to Be Collected	114
Recording the Data	115
Administering the Data Collection	116
Data Collection in Mixed Methods Designs	116
Concurrent Data Collection Issues	117
<i>Participant Selection</i>	119
<i>The Sample Size Question</i>	119
<i>When Contradictory Results Occur</i>	120
<i>Introducing Potential Bias Through Data Collection</i>	120
Sequential Data Collection Issues	121
<i>Sampling the Same or Different Individuals</i>	122
<i>Using the Same or Different Sample Sizes</i>	123
<i>Selecting Results for the Follow-Up</i>	123
<i>Designing an Instrument</i>	123
SUMMARY	125
ACTIVITIES	127
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	127
Chapter 7. Analyzing Data in Mixed Methods Research	128
Procedures in Quantitative and Qualitative Data Analysis	128
Preparing the Data for Analysis	130
Exploring the Data	130
Analyzing the Data	131
Representing the Data Analysis	132
Validating the Data	133
Data Analysis Within Mixed Methods Designs	135
Concurrent Data Analysis	136
<i>Data Transformation</i>	137
<i>Comparisons Through a Matrix or Discussion</i>	140
Sequential Data Analysis	142
<i>When Quantitative Data Are Collected First</i>	144
<i>When Qualitative Data Are Collected First</i>	145
Validate the Data Within a Mixed Methods Design	145
SUMMARY	148
ACTIVITIES	149
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	149

Chapter 8. Writing and Evaluating Mixed Methods Research	151
General Guidelines for Writing	152
Organize the Structure of the Writing So That It Relates to the Designs	153
Structure of a Proposal for a Dissertation or Thesis	154
Structure of the Project Narrative for a National Institutes of Health Proposal	157
Structure of a Mixed Methods Journal Article	159
Evaluating a Mixed Methods Study Within Designs	162
Quantitative and Qualitative Standards	163
Mixed Methods Standards	163
SUMMARY	165
ACTIVITIES	165
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	166
Chapter 9. Questions Often Raised About Mixed Methods Research	167
Anticipate Mixed Methods Questions	168
What Is Mixed Methods Research?	168
It Is Not Just Qualitative Research	168
It Is Not Mixed Model Research	169
It Is Not a Method That Researchers Have Always Used	169
It Is an Approach That Can Be Learned	170
<i>Published Journal Articles</i>	170
<i>Methodological Literature</i>	170
<i>Syntheses of Mixed Methods Studies</i>	172
It Has a Philosophical or Worldview Foundation	173
Is Mixed Methods Research Accepted?	174
Several Factors Have Sparked Interest	175
If It Is Rigorous, Graduate Faculty Will Support It	175
Funding Agencies Support Mixed Methods Research	176
Journals Will Publish It	177
Acceptance Is Extending to Different Disciplines and Across Cultures	178
Is Mixed Methods Research Realistic?	180
Researchers Need Specific Skills	180
It Requires Time and Resources	181
SUMMARY	182
ACTIVITIES	183
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	183
Chapter 10. Future Directions for Mixed Methods Research	184
Needed Developments in Mixed Methods Research	185
Mixed Methods Designs and Associated Procedural Issues	185

Mixed Methods Designs and Different Worldviews	189
Applications of Mixed Methods Research	190
Implications and the Value of Using Mixed Methods	191
SUMMARY	192
ACTIVITIES	193
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES TO EXAMINE	193
Appendix A. A Triangulation Design	194
Appendix B. An Embedded Design	204
Appendix C. An Explanatory Design	216
Appendix D. An Exploratory Design	239
References	256
Index	266
About the Authors	274

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1. Selected Writers Important in the Development of Mixed Methods Research and Their Contributions	14
Table 2.1. Four Worldviews Used in Research	22
Table 2.2. Common Elements of Worldviews and Implications for Practice	24
Table 2.3. The Four Elements Basic to Any Research Process	25
Table 2.4. Elements of Qualitative and Quantitative Research in the Process of Research	29
Table 2.5. Types of Research Problems and Matching Methods or Designs	32
Table 3.1. Features of the Four Sample Mixed Methods Studies	55
Table 4.1. Mixed Methods Design Classifications	60
Table 4.2. The Major Mixed Methods Design Types	85
Table 5.1. Deficiencies in the Literature, Type of Design, and Reasons for Using the Design	96
Table 5.2. Types of Mixed Methods Designs, Variants, and Research Questions	106
Table 6.1. Phases in the Data Collection Process for Qualitative and Quantitative Research	111
Table 7.1. Procedures in Quantitative and Qualitative Data Analysis	129
Table 7.2. Example of Matrix Using Qualitative Theme Counts, Including Data Transformation	139
Table 7.3. Example of Matrix Using Quantitative Variables (Strengths) and Qualitative Themes, With Text Data Quotes	141
Table 7.4. Potential Threats to the Validity of Concurrent Designs in Mixed Methods Research	147
Table 7.5. Potential Threats to the Validity of Sequential Designs in Mixed Methods Research	148
Table 8.1. Outline of the Structure of a Proposal for a Dissertation or Thesis	155

Table 8.2. National Institutes of Health Guidelines for a Proposal Narrative for a Mixed Methods Study	158
Table 8.3. Outline of the Structure for a Mixed Methods Journal Article	161
Table 9.1. Literature Review Syntheses of the "Methods" in Mixed Methods Research Studies From Different Disciplines	174
Table 10.1. Topics for Future Research and Questions That Need to Be Answered	186

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1. Framework Used in This Book for Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research	3
Figure 1.2. Three Ways of Mixing Quantitative and Qualitative Data	7
Figure 1.3. Examples of Single- and Multiple-Study Mixed Methods Research	8
Figure 2.1. The Birthday Cake	36
Figure 3.1. Ten Guidelines for Drawing Visual Diagrams for Mixed Methods Studies	42
Figure 3.2. Checklist for Reviewing the Features of a Mixed Methods Study	44
Figure 3.3. Visual Diagram of the Procedures in a Study in Which Both Quantitative and Qualitative Data Were Collected at the Same Time	46
Figure 3.4. Visual Diagram of the Procedures in a Study Using Qualitative Data Within an Experiment	49
Figure 3.5. Visual Diagram of the Procedures in a Study Using Qualitative Data to Explain Quantitative Results	51
Figure 3.6. Visual Diagram of the Procedures Used to Measure Exploratory Qualitative Results With Quantitative Data	53
Figure 4.1. The Triangulation Design	63
Figure 4.2. The Embedded Design	68
Figure 4.3. The Explanatory Design	73
Figure 4.4. The Exploratory Design	76
Figure 4.5. Decision Tree for Mixed Methods Design Criteria for Timing, Weighting, and Mixing	80
Figure 4.6. Sample Paragraph Introducing a Mixed Methods Design	87
Figure 6.1. Concurrent Forms of Mixed Methods Data Collection	118
Figure 6.2. Sequential Forms of Mixed Methods Data Collection	122
Figure 6.3. Procedures for an Exploratory Instrument Design Mixed Methods Study	126

Figure 7.1. Concurrent Data Analysis Procedures in Triangulation and Embedded Designs	137
Figure 7.2. Portion of Discussion Section Examining a Comparison of Quantitative and Qualitative Data Results	142
Figure 7.3. Sequential Data Analysis Procedures in Embedded Explanatory and Exploratory Designs	143
Figure 9.1. Examples of Mixed Methods Studies, by Design Type	171
Figure 9.2. Suggested Methodological Readings on Mixed Methods Research	173
Figure 9.3. Checklist for Evaluating the Level of Acceptance of Mixed Methods Research Within a Discipline	179

PREFACE

PURPOSE OF THIS BOOK •

Researchers in the social, health, and human sciences have a wide range of research methods from which to choose. These methods range from the quantitative to the qualitative, and now researchers and graduate students across the social sciences have begun to combine these methods in mixed methods designs. Mixed methods research has been gaining in acceptance and becoming more common in studies across the social sciences, including diverse fields such as sociology, nursing, health, management, evaluation, and education.

From our collective research experiences and conversations with colleagues, we have found that a mixed methods approach has interdisciplinary appeal to many researchers. These researchers hold increasingly diverse worldviews and tackle complex issues and problems that beg for a blending of qualitative and quantitative data. Hence, mixed methods designs provide researchers, across research disciplines, with a rigorous approach to answering their research questions.

Much has been written about the use of mixed methods, but these writings are, typically, difficult to locate and are conceptual and theoretical in nature rather than applied. In addition, there is little available practical advice about how to actually design and conduct a mixed methods research study that is both of acceptable quality and feasible.

The purpose of this book is to provide an introduction to mixed methods research, to discuss the steps involved in designing and conducting this form of inquiry, and, within these steps, to focus on four types of mixed methods designs. We set out to write a book that builds from the literature and offers mixed methods researchers practical advice for conceptualizing, proposing, designing, conducting, and publishing their mixed methods studies. Our hope is that a better understanding of mixed methods research can result in better research across the social, health, and human sciences.

Furthermore, it may lead to the development of a new generation of researchers who have the skills and experiences to use wisely those research techniques and tools that are most appropriate for the complex questions being studied today, as well as those that will be studied in the future.

● AUDIENCE FOR THE BOOK

This book targets advanced graduate students as well as researchers at all levels from diverse disciplines who are designing mixed methods studies. We have attempted to combine the latest thinking about mixed methods research designs with practical, step-by-step guidelines and recommendations for the decisions that researchers must make when designing a mixed methods research study. We offer advice that will assist researchers in negotiating the demands and issues that arise as they design a mixed methods project, including suggestions on how to keep a project manageable for a beginning researcher and still ensure quality research. The book concludes with a discussion of current issues in mixed methods research and the common questions that confront mixed methods researchers who are planning a mixed methods study. We hear these questions asked time and time again when we work with researchers individually, at workshops, and in graduate courses.

● BOOK FEATURES

We have incorporated a number of features throughout the book to facilitate its use by researchers designing their own studies and by graduate students learning about mixed methods research in a course or seminar. We have organized the content using an overall guiding framework of the process of designing and conducting a mixed methods study. Although aspects of this process may simplify the reality of a complex and nonlinear process, they provide a guiding framework that can be very helpful to researchers new to mixed methods research. In addition, we discuss mixed methods research in terms of a parsimonious set of four major types of designs, and we highlight variants within each of the major designs. To help illustrate the practical side of conducting mixed methods research, we have included four complete mixed methods articles in the book, and we refer to additional examples drawn from across the social, behavioral, and health sciences.

The content of the book takes the reader through the process of designing and conducting a research study. Building on the ideas discussed within Creswell's (2003) *Research Design*, we introduce each topic by reviewing its

application within quantitative and qualitative research and then address it from the point of view of mixed methods research in general and from the perspective of each of the four mixed methods designs in particular. We emphasize the procedures and special challenges that researchers face in each of the designs and offer practical guidelines, checklists, and scripts to help researchers plan out and implement a rigorous mixed methods design. Each chapter concludes with a short list of important references that readers can turn to for a more theoretical treatment of the topics. To facilitate the adoption of this text for a graduate level course or its use in a seminar, a brief list of suggested activities to guide the reader through specific steps in developing and writing a proposal for a mixed methods study is also included at the end of each chapter.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ●

Our work and this book has benefited greatly from the contributions of many. We begin by thanking our acquisition editor at Sage Publications, Lisa Cuevas Shaw, for her encouragement, coordination, and support throughout the project. We also thank Allison Munditt, executive vice president at Sage Publications, for her continued support of our writing on research methods, and Catherine Chilton for her thoughtful and detailed editing. Several individuals deserve thanks because they took the time to carefully review the manuscript. Dr. Ronald J. Shope of our Office of Qualitative and Mixed Methods Research at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln provided a thoughtful review, with close attention to many aspects of the project, and three anonymous reviewers wrote helpful suggestions for early revisions of the manuscript.

We also thank Dr. Nataliya V. Ivankova of the University of Alabama–Birmingham and Dr. Michael Feters of the University of Michigan, who helped us shape many ideas discussed in this book through their methodological work and their involvement as workshop leaders. We are also grateful for the questions, insights, and feedback offered by those scholars, to whom we are indebted, who participated in our workshops across many disciplines and across many regions of the United States and abroad. We also thank the graduate students who have taken our mixed methods course, which has been offered at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln since 1998. Individuals in our Office of Qualitative and Mixed Methods Research at the University of Nebraska–Lincoln also helped shape our ideas through conducting mixed methods studies: Dr. Yun Lu, Dr. Shirley Trout, Jill Brown, Rob McEntarffer, and Mike Wirth. We are also indebted to the Department of Family Medicine at the University of Michigan and to the Veterans Affairs Ann